1

9

11

2 3 4 5 6 7 8 10 LISREL 8.54: A PROGRAM FOR STRUCTURAL EQUATION 12 13 MODELLING WITH LATENT VARIABLES 14 15 **DARIO CZIRÁKY*** 16 Department of Statistics, London School of Economics, Houghton Street, London WC2A 2AE, UK 17 18 19 20 1. INTRODUCTION 21 22 LISREL 8.54 is a computer program originally designed for estimation of a general structural 23 24 equation model developed by Karl Jöreskog in the early 1970s (Jöreskog, 1973). Its current 25 version, LISREL 8.54, is an advanced statistical program for multivariate analysis of linear systems with latent or unobserved variables, econometric structural equation systems, and a variety 26 27 of factor analytic methods and covariance structure models. Recent developments also include 28 powerful procedures for analysis with non-metric variables including latent variable models with 29 ordinal indicators. 30 The core code of the program is written in FORTRAN, but over the last decade its current vendor, 31 Scientific Software International Inc. (SSI), developed an impressive interactive visual interface 32 in C/C + + that made LISREL one of the most user-friendly multivariate analysis packages 33 available. While preserving its raw power and flexibility, this multi-language architecture, however, 34 contributed to instability problems associated with the 8.50/8.51 versions. Several subsequent 35 upgrades have resulted in the 8.54 release that now more closely resembles the power and reliability 36 of the earlier versions of this program. 37 The LISREL 8.54 program (LISWIN32.EXE) is a 32-bit Windows application which interfaces 38 with several modules, the main two of which are LISREL (LISREL85.EXE) and PRELIS 39 (PRELIS25.EXE).¹ PRELIS was developed later than LISREL with the main purpose of providing 40 a pre-processor and data transformation front-end to LISREL. 41 42

¹Specifically, LISWIN32.EXE interfaces with the 32-bit applications LISREL85.EXE, PRELIS25.EXE, MULTI-45

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

⁴³ * Correspondence to: Dario Cziráky, Department of Statistics, London School of Economics, Houghton Street, London/WC2A 2AR, UK.. E-mail: cziraky@policy.hu 44

LEV5.EXE, CATFIRM.EXE and CONFIRM.EXE. These are modules designed for specific statistical procedures such as 46 estimation of multilevel structural equation models.

D. CZIRÁKY

LISREL 8.54 is strongly flavoured by the structure and logic of Jöreskog's general structural equation model, which is often referred to simply as 'LISREL' in the literature.² The most important aspect of this model and of the overall modelling philosophy of LISREL 8.54 is its general nature, which encompasses most of the classical linear econometric and factor-analytic models as special cases. In fact, most of the experimental designs such as ANOVA, MANOVA, dummy variable regression, etc. can be specified as special cases of the general LISREL model (see e.g. Cziráky *et al.*, 2003a).

The LISREL model is given by three matrix equations: the measurement model for the latent exogenous variables $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{\Lambda}_x \boldsymbol{\xi} + \boldsymbol{\delta}$, the measurement model for the latent endogenous variables $\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{\Lambda}_y \boldsymbol{\eta} + \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}$, and the structural equation model $\boldsymbol{\eta} = \mathbf{B}\boldsymbol{\eta} + \Gamma \boldsymbol{\xi} + \boldsymbol{\zeta}$. Here $\mathbf{\Lambda}_x, \mathbf{\Lambda}_y$, **B** and Γ are coefficient matrices, and $\boldsymbol{\delta}, \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}$ and $\boldsymbol{\zeta}$ are vectors of latent errors. As I will explain shortly, much of modelling with LISREL centres around specifying various special cases of this general model by referring to the elements of the above matrices.

2. IMPLEMENTATION

18 LISREL 8.54 is distributed on a CD as a self-extracting installation file. The installation is a simple 19 and short one-step process. Previous versions need to be updated with self-installing patch files, 20 which can be downloaded for free from the distributor's web site. A free time-limited demo and 21 student versions are available, as are rental versions and versions for other platforms (see Table I 22 for details). The installation includes a large number of examples and an extensive interactive 23 help facility. Included examples, which are selected from a variety of social science applications, 24 are well suited for classroom use. Most examples are briefly discussed in the manuals but not 25 in the otherwise excellent help facility, which is a drawback. The interactive help options are 26 particularly usefully designed and allow the novice user to build complex models from scratch by 27 following step-by-step on-screen instructions. An especially useful feature is that the help facility 28 can be used while analysing the data without needing to switch between the help window and the 29 command prompt. The online help file includes the user's guide to LISREL's user interface, new 30 statistical features and syntax. Technical support is also excellent.

31 32

15 16

17

33

34

3. DOCUMENTATION

35 A decent collection of manuals for LISREL 8.54 is available at extra cost. The manuals are 36 extensive but not always helpful. The main LISREL manual (Jöreskog and Sörbom, 1996c) is an 37 excellent reference manual for the LISREL command language. It provides lots of examples and 38 a good overview of the statistical methods behind the program. This relatively old manual was 39 amended with an addendum volume (Jöreskog et al., 2001). However, the two manuals were not 40 integrated into a single volume. The second command language for LISREL 8.54, the SIMPLIS 41 language, has a separate manual (Jöreskog and Sörbom, 1996b), which is however much less 42 informative than the LISREL manual. Finally, recently developed interactive features are covered 43 by Du Toit and Du Toit (2001), and the PRELIS module has a separate, relatively good manual 44

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

 $[\]frac{45}{46} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{100} \frac{1}$

endor:	Scientific Software International Inc.,
	7383 N. Lincoln Ave, Suite 100,
	Lincolnwood, IL 60712-1704, USA
Authors:	Karl Jöreskog, Dag Sörbom
Pricing:	PC individual licence: \$445
	Set of 5 manuals: \$130
student edition:	Free, limited to 12 variables
Trial & rental editions:	Free, fully-featured trial edition limited to 15 days, and 6- or 12-month
	rentals are available from www.e-academy.com
el:	800-247-6113, 847-675-0720
Fax:	847-675-2140
WWW:	http://www.ssicentral.com
Tech support:	techsupport@ssicentral.com
Hardware & software supported:	IBM PCs, AIX, Solaris and TRU64 on RISC hardware, Macintosh
	version will be released in Summer 2003, MS Windows
	(95/98/ME/NT/2000/XP), Linux, UNIX, Open VMS
Multivariate routines (partial listing):	IV/TSLS/ULS/GLS/ML/WLS/DWLS Estimation of Structural
	Equation Models with Latent Variables, Structural Modelling with
	Incomplete Data, Efficient FIML for Incomplete Data that are
	Missing at Random, Multilevel Structural Equation Modelling with
	Complete and Incomplete Data, Nonlinear Multilevel Modelling,
	EM/MCMC for Imputing Incomplete Data that are Missing at
	Random, Exploratory and Confirmatory Maximum Likelihood
	Factor Analysis, Latent Curve Modelling, Minimum Fit Function
	χ^2 , Normal Theory Weighted
Fit statistics (partial listing):	Least Squares χ^2 , Satorra–Bentler Scaled χ^2 , χ^2 Corrected for
	Non-Normality, Population Discrepancy Function, Root Mean
	Square Error of Approximation, Expected Cross-Validation Index,
	Normed Fit Index, Non-Normed Fit Index, Parsimony Normed Fit
	Index, Comparative Fit Index, Incremental Fit Index, Relative Fit
	Index, Goodness of Fit Index

28 (Jöreskog and Sörbom, 1996a). Indexing of all manuals is very good with separate author and 29 subject indices. Unfortunately, economic examples in the manuals are scarce and notably dated.

30 31

32

33

4. DATA MANIPULATION: PRELIS

34 PRELIS, an integral part of LISREL 8.54, is a pre-processor designed to perform data manipulation, 35 transformations, data import/export, descriptive analysis and graphics. Upon importing data into 36 PRELIS, the program transforms it into a 'PRELIS system file' (.psf) which stores information on 37 the number of observations, number of variables, variable names, type of variables, category 38 labels and missing value codes, as well as the raw data. PRELIS enables file import from 39 over 80 different formats. However, file export options are only comma separated (.csv), tab 40 delimited (.txt), ASCII (.dat) and SPSS (.sav) formats. PRELIS has its own command language 41 (stored in files with extension .pr2) and a menu-driven user interface that enables interactive 42 model specification. To give an example of the PRELIS syntax, the following code performs an 43 instrumental variables regression, written by specifying a path to the file, with RG for 'regression' 44 of variable 1 on variables 2, 3 and 4, using variables 5, 6, 7 and 8 as instruments. The numbers 45 of the variables relate to their position in the data file, and the OU command specifies various 46 output options:

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

D. CZIRÁKY

```
1 SY=`C:\....\FILE.PSF'
2 RG 1 ON 2 3 4 WITH 5 6 7 8
3 OU MA=CM XT XM
4
```

PRELIS includes a data transformation calculator capable of performing most standard trans-5 formations. An exceptionally useful feature is the ability to perform normal score transforms. 6 Together with univariate and multivariate normality tests, this makes PRELIS an excellent envi-7 ronment for preliminary analysis when modelling aims to proceed in the Gaussian multivariate 8 framework. Descriptive analysis of an entire data set can be performed with a single mouse click, 9 10 which results in detailed and informative output. The output file appears in a separate window, originally as a text file, but it can be automatically converted into RTF, HTML and TEX formats. 11 The formatted output appears in a new window and can be copied on the clipboard or directly 12 inserted into a word processor or a LATEX compiler. The output conversion generally works well 13 if the output was not edited before conversion. The RTF output will save hours of typing to the 14 users of commercial word processors, as it produces formatted tables that can easily be edited by 15 any major word processing software. This additional editing is necessary because the PRELIS-16 formatted output is still short of being publication quality, and larger tables get broken into several 17 18 smaller ones, all of which requires additional editing. The conversion of output into TEX format is merely a way to print slightly nicer-looking output, and it should be further improved. 19

- 20
- 21 22

5. MODELLING AND ESTIMATION: LISREL

23 The modelling philosophy of LISREL 8.54 is rather different from that of most standard 24 econometric packages. With each release, this package includes more of the standard procedures 25 as part of the interactive (and batch) implementation of PRELIS. However, its main flavour can 26 be summarized by saying that if a model can be formulated as a special case of Jöreskog's 27 general structural model, it can be estimated with LISREL 8.54. This generally holds whether the 28 variables one wishes to use are continuous, ordinal or binary. Naturally, standard conditions such as 29 identification of the model, convergence criteria and admissibility of the solution apply. However, 30 some of these aspects are under the control of the user, e.g. convergence and admissibility can 31 be user-defined or, in the case of admissibility, switched off. For simple applications, formulating 32 the model within the LISREL framework would take far more effort than using a general-purpose 33 package like E-Views or SPSS, especially if the LISREL batch language is used. However, for more 34 complex structural equation models, particularly models including latent variables, the LISREL 35 approach is advantageous. 36

As an example, the LISREL syntax for maximum likelihood estimation of a structural equation model with nine observed and four latent variables from Cziráky *et al.* (2003b, pp. 12-13)³ can be written as:

40 DA NI=9 NO=192

⁴¹ LA 42 y1 y2 y3 y4 x1 x2 y5 y6 y7 43 SE

44 45

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

J. Appl. Econ. 19: 0 (2004)

4

 ⁴¹⁵ ³ This example is a regional development model for Slovenia where observations are 192 municipalities and latent variables are economic, structural, social and demographic development factors.

```
1
    1 2 3 4 7 8 9 5 6/
 2
    CM=SLO.CM
 3
    MO NX=2 NY=7 NK=1 NE=3 BE=FU PS=DI TE=SY
 4
    LE
 5
    Etal Eta2 Eta3
 6
    LK
 7
    Ksi1
 8
    FR LY(3,1) LY(3,2) LY(4,2) LY(4,3)
9
    FR LY(5,1) LY(5,3) LY(7,1) LX(1,1) LX(2,1)
10
    FR BE(1,2) BE(1,3) BE(2,3)
11
    FR TE(4,2)
12
    VA 1 LY(1,1) LY(2,2) LY(6,3)
13
    OU RS ND=3
14
      The principal feature of the LISREL command language is the necessity to specify individual
15
    elements of the 'LISREL matrices' that should be estimated, although built-in defaults can be
16
    used to simplify the syntax. Alternatively, it is possible to use a simpler but less flexible command
17
    language, SIMPLIS. The above LISREL code can be written equivalently in the SIMPLIS
18
    command language as:
19
20
    Observed variables: y1 y2 y3 y4 x1 x2 y5 y6 y7
21
    Covariance Matrix From File SLO.CM
22
    Sample size: 192
23
    Latent variables: Etal Eta2 Eta3 Ksi1
24
    Equations:
25
    y1=1*Eta1
26
    y3 y5 y7=Eta1
27
    y2=1*Eta2
28
    y3 y4=Eta2
29
    y6=1*Eta3
30
    y4 y5=Eta3
31
    x1 x2=Ksi1
32
    Etal Eta2 Eta3=Ksi1
33
    Etal Eta2=Eta3
34
    Eta1=Eta2
35
    Set the Variance of Ksil to 1.00
36
    Set the Error Covariance of y4 and y2 Free
37
    LISREL output: ME=ML RS ND=3
38
39
    Both sets of commands produce the same output. In addition, an interactive path diagram can be
40
    built automatically by including a 'path diagram' command in SIMPLIS code or a 'PD' command
41
    in LISREL code. Once such a path diagram, or graphical representation of the model, is obtained,
42
    a built-in translator can be used to convert it into either SIMPLIS or LISREL syntax. However,
43
    this translation is frequently imperfect. In this particular example, an attempt to generate LISREL
44
    code results in misspecification of the \Theta_{\varepsilon} matrix (the covariance matrix of the latent errors from
45
    the endogenous measurement model), which erroneously gets specified as diagonal. That is, the
46
    TE = SY command on the MO line, and the line FR TE(4, 2) are omitted. This tends to happen
```

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

D. CZIRÁKY

1 with models that have correlated errors, and it primarily occurs with the covariance matrices of 2 the latent errors, Θ_{ε} and Θ_{δ} . If syntax translation is used only for quick generation of the basic 3 syntax, the level of translation accuracy is generally sufficient.

The LISREL data input can be either in the form of raw data (or PRELIS system file) or in the form of a covariance/correlation matrix (with or without means). In the above example, a covariance matrix from file SLOV.CM was used for estimation. A model-implied covariance structure can be postulated and its coefficients can be estimated from the covariance or correlation matrix calculated directly from data. This means that estimation can be based only on covariance or correlation matrices, except when using the full information maximum likelihood (FIML) method for data with missing values and multilevel structural equation modelling.

Numerical algorithms can be controlled in terms of specifying convergence criteria (i.e. number of steps and admissibility of solution) and significantly improved by a careful application of starting values. LISREL 8.54 is surprisingly fast in estimating complex models, but care must be taken when complicated non-linear covariance structures are estimated. Initial estimates are computed automatically using a 2SLS procedure (if not provided by the user), but experimentation with different starting values might help avoid local minima and misleading solutions.

The LISREL output depends on the syntax used. It can be either in equation format (SIMPLIS) or in matrix format (LISREL). In each case, by default, a large number of fit statistics are printed at the end of the output (see Table I). Since the main evaluation statistics are in the form of the overall fit measures, diagnostics related to raw data should be calculated before LISREL analysis by using PRELIS. The emphasis on fit statistics is a logical inheritance from covariance structure analysis, but there is a notable lack of diagnostic tests, most notably tests for heteroskedasticity, which is a major deficiency given the cross-sectional focus of this package.

6. GRAPHICS

27 LISREL graphics include path diagrams (i.e. graphical representations of structural equation 28 models) and various descriptive univariate and multivariate plots. The path diagrams are interactive 29 and, in principle, enable estimation of most LISREL models interactively. Path diagrams can be 30 printed and exported in .wmf and .gif formats. Unfortunately, there is no option to save files in 31 PostScript format. The path diagrams can be edited on screen, which is generally necessary since 32 model estimation often generates badly formatted diagrams. The graphical quality of path diagrams 33 should be further improved, especially if the aim of the software is to produce publication-quality 34 output. Quality of the other plots and graphs is relatively good, but still inferior in comparison 35 with graphics produced by packages such as Statistica or PcGive. 36

37

25 26

38 39

7. CONCLUSION

LISREL 8.54 is an advanced package for structural equation modelling that incorporates a number
 of procedures of high value to applied econometricians. Since its main focus is on cross-sectional
 models, its usefulness for time-series analysis is currently quite limited.

In view of recent developments such as Bai (2003), which suggest that dynamic latent variable models are gaining in popularity, modelling time-series data is something that should be seriously considered in future development of this package. In particular, economic applications of latent variable models, such as Aasness *et al.* (1993), where LISREL is used for estimation, should be

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

SOFTWARE REVIEW

1 discussed in the manuals or included among the examples. While applicability of the existing 2 estimation methods to time-series data requires extensive theoretical investigation, some minor 3 improvements, such as commands for creating lagged values and time-series diagnostic tests, 4 might be straightforwardly included. This would significantly improve LISREL's usefulness to 5 economics researchers. 6 Another current limitation is that the models LISREL can handle are primarily linear. Otherwise, 7 the class of models that can be formulated and estimated with this package is exceptionally rich. 8 Finally, the reliability of version 8.54 is good enough to pass demanding tests. This is a significant 9 improvement over previous releases, especially the very crash-prone 8.50 and 8.51. 10 11

12

13

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

14 I would like to thank James MacKinnon, Karl Jöreskog, Gerhard Mels, Leo Stam and Ettore Dal

15 Fara for helpful comments and suggestions. Opinions and all remaining errors are my own.

- 16
- 17 18

REFERENCES

- Aasness J, Biørn E, Skjerpen T. 1993. Engel functions, panel data, and latent variables. *Econometrica* 61: 1395–1422.
- 21 Bai J. 2003. Inferential theory for factor models of large dimensions. *Econometrica* 71: 135–171.
- Cziráky D, Filipan T, Pisarović A. 2003a. Multivariate modelling in experimental designs. In *Developments in Applied Statistics*, Ferligoj A, Mrvoj A (eds), *Metodološki zvezki* 19. FDV: Ljubljana; 138–155.
- Cziráky D, Sambt J, Rovan J, Puljiz J, Maleković S, Polić M. 2003b. Regional development assessment using parametric and non-parametric methods: a comparative analysis of Slovenia and Croatia. Proceedings from the 43rd European Regional Science Association (ERSA) Congress, Jyväskyklä: ERSA (R-session papers).

Du Toit M, Du Toit S. 2001. Interactive LISREL: User's Guide. Scientific Software International: Lincolnwood, IL.

- Jöreskog KG. 1973. A general method for estimating a linear structural equation system. In *Structural Equation Models in the Social Sciences*, Goldberger AS, Duncan OD (eds). Academic Press: Chicago; 85–112.
- 31 Jöreskog KG, Sörbom D. 1996a. PRELIS 2 User's Reference Guide: A Program for Multivariate Data
- Screening and Data Summarization; A Preprocessor for LISREL. Scientific Software International: Chicago.
 Jöreskog KG, Sörbom D. 1996b. LISREL 8: Structural Equation Modeling with the SIMPLIS Command
 Language Scientific Software International: Chicago
- *Language*. Scientific Software International: Chicago.
- Jöreskog KG, Sörbom D. 1996c. LISREL 8 User's Reference Guide. Scientific Software International:
 Chicago.
- Jöreskog KG, Sörbom D, Du Toit S, Du Toit M. 2001. LISREL 8: New Statistical Features. Scientific
 Software International: Lincolnwood, IL.
- 38
- 39
- 40
- 40
- 42
- 43
- 44
- 45 46

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.